

# राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग एवं अवसंरचना विकास निगम लिमिटेड

सड़क परिवहन और राजमार्ग मंत्रालय, भारत सरकार  
तीसरी मंजिल, पीटीआई बिल्डिंग, 4-संसद मार्ग, नई दिल्ली-110001

**National Highways & Infrastructure Development Corporation Limited**

Ministry of Road Transport & Highways, Govt. of India  
3rd Floor, PTI Building, 4-Parliament Street, New Delhi-110001, +91 11 23461600, www.nhidcl.com



(भारत सरकार का उद्यम)

(A Government of India Enterprise)

NHIDCL/J&K/NH-244/K-K/AE(P345)/2021-22 | 538

17.08.2021

To  
All The Bidders,

**Subject:** – CONSULTANCY SERVICES FOR AUTHORITY'S ENGINEER FOR SUPERVISION OF (I) Construction & Upgradation to 2 lane with paved shoulder from Design Km. 67.805 (at the end of Km 83rd tunnel near Dhrabshala) to Km 80.675 (Dulhasti) of 12.87 Km length on Khellani - Kishtwar -Chattroo section of NH-244 in the Union Territory of Jammu & Kashmir on EPC mode (Pkg -III). & (II) Construction of Kishtwar bypass with 2 lane with paved shoulder from Design Km. 80.675 (Dulhasti) to Km 95.550 (bandarkoot ) of 14.88 Km length on Khellani - Kishtwar -Chattroo section and a link road to Kishtwar town of 1.871 km on NH-244 in the Union Territory of Jammu & Kashmir on EPC mode (Pkg -IV). & (III) Construction /Up gradation 2 lane with paved shoulder from Design Km 95.55 (Bandarkoot ) to Km. 111.06 (Chattroo) of 15.52 Km length on Khellani - Kishtwar -Chattroo section on NH-244 in the Union Territory of Jammu & Kashmir on EPC mode (Pkg -V) - **Technical Evaluation Result - reg.**


Ref.: Your Bid Dated 05.08.2021.

Sir,

Please refer to your proposal for the project cited above. In this regard technical evaluation result is as under:-

Sr. No.	Name of Bidder	Eligible for Financial Opening
1	Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Association MAV Associates	Not Eligible
2	L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	Not Eligible
3	Shrikhande Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association Infra design Studio Pvt. Ltd.	Eligible
4	Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association OTP Consulting LLP	Eligible

2. Financial bids will be opened on 17.08.2021 at 1800 hrs.

  
B. Shivprasad  
General Manager (Tech.)

**National Highways & Infrastructure Development Corporation Limited**  
**(Ministry of Road Transport & Highways, Government of India)**

**Minutes of Meeting** of Technical Bid Evaluation Committee (TEC) to evaluate the Technical bids for **CONSULTANCY SERVICES FOR AUTHORITY'S ENGINEER FOR SUPERVISION OF**

(I) Construction & Upgradation to 2 lane with paved shoulder from Design Km. 67.805 (at the end of Km 83rd tunnel near Dhrabshala) to Km 80.675 (Dulhasti) of 12.87 Km length on Khellani - Kishtwar -Chattroo section of NH-244 in the Union Territory of Jammu & Kashmir on EPC mode (Pkg -III). &

(II) Construction of Kishtwar bypass with 2 lane with paved shoulder from Design Km. 80.675 (Dulhasti) to Km 95.550 (bandarkoot ) of 14.88 Km length on Khellani - Kishtwar -Chattroo section and a link road to Kishtwar town of 1.871 km on NH-244 in the Union Territory of Jammu & Kashmir on EPC mode (Pkg -IV). &

(III) Construction /Up gradation 2 lane with paved shoulder from Design Km 95.55 (Bandarkoot ) to Km. 111.06 (Chattroo) of 15.52 Km length on Khellani - Kishtwar -Chattroo section on NH-244 in the Union Territory of Jammu & Kashmir on EPC mode (Pkg -V).

**Date:** 11.08.2021 (11:00 AM)

**Venue:** PTI Building, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, Conference Hall, NHIDCL HQ, New Delhi.

Having opened the Technical bids on 05.08.2021, Technical Evaluation Committee (TEC) met on 11.08.2021 to evaluate the proposals as per the terms of RFP document.

2. Member Secretary apprised that:

- a) As per clause 4.1 of Section-2 of RFP, bidders are required to submit their Technical Proposal only through online mode i.e. via CPP portal and INFRACON portal and no separate hard copy was required to be submitted.
- b) 04 (four) firms submitted their bids on Infracon Portal and CPP Portal by due date and time. Details of firms are as under:

S. No.	Name of the bidder
1.	Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Association MAV Associates
2.	L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.
3.	Shrikhande Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association Infra design Studio Pvt. Ltd.
4.	Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association OTP Consulting LLP

3. The Committee noted that the Consultants had submitted their Technical Proposal on e-Procurement Portal i.e. on CPP Portal & INFRACON portal and the evaluation has been carried out based on the details submitted by bidders. The proposals were examined as per Section-2 (Letter of Invitation to Consultants) Data Sheet of RFP Document. Details of documents submitted by the bidders w.r.t Clause 4.1 (B) of RFP are attached at **Annexure-I**.

4. The technical evaluation of the above mentioned qualified firms were carried out. The key points observed during technical evaluation are summed up as follows:

#### **4.1 Relevant experience for assignments:-**

The marks obtained by the firms towards relevant experience for assignments are enclosed as **Annexure-II** which is summarized below:

Sr. No.	Name of the firm	Maximum Marks	Marks obtained
1.	Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Association MAV Associates	40	40
2.	L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.		40
3.	Shrikhande Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association Infra design Studio Pvt. Ltd.		40
4.	Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association OTP Consulting LLP		40

#### **4.2 Experience in use of technology for road inspection proposed to be used:**

The marks obtained by the firms towards technology for road inspection proposed to be used for assignments are enclosed as **Annexure-III** which is summarized below:

Sr. No.	Name of the firm	Maximum Marks	Marks obtained
1.	Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Association MAV Associates	20	19
2.	L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.		20
3.	Shrikhande Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association Infra design Studio Pvt. Ltd.		15
4.	Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association OTP Consulting LLP		16

#### 4.3 Qualifications and competence of the proposed key personnel :

The marks obtained by the key personnel of the firms towards Qualifications and competence of the proposed key personnel for assignments are enclosed as **Annexure-IV** which is summarized below:

Position	Total marks	1	2	3	4
		Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Association MAV Associates	L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	Shrikhande Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association Infra design Studio Pvt. Ltd.	Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association OTP Consulting LLP
		Marks	Marks	Marks	Marks
Team Leader cum Senior Bridge Engineer	12	4.32	4.32	10.92	10.68
Resident cum Highway Engineer	6	Not evaluated as per clause 3.4(x)(e)	Not evaluated as per clause 3.4(x)(e)	5.46	5.46
Bridge/Structural Engineer	6			5.46	5.04
Senior Quality cum Material Expert	6			5.46	5.46
Senior Contract Specialist	6			6.00	5.46
Road Safety Expert	4			3.64	3.80
<b>Total</b>	<b>40</b>			<b>36.94</b>	<b>35.90</b>

4.3 (a) As per clause 3.4 (x) (e), “The CV of the proposed Team Leader should score at least 75 % marks otherwise the entire proposal shall not be considered Further. As per above table in para 4.3, CV of Team Leader cum Senior Bridge Engineer scores less than 75% marks, hence the entire proposal of firm is to be considered failed in the evaluation of Technical Proposals and accordingly the bidders M/s. Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Association MAV Associates and M/s L. N. Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd. are not eligible for next stage of evaluation i.e. Evaluation of Financial Proposal.

5. The final technical scores of the firms w. r. t. above mentioned four criteria of technical evaluation are mentioned as under:

Summary of evaluation of Technical Proposals						Remarks
S. No.	Name of the Firm	Relevant experience for assignments	Experience in use of technology for road inspection	Qualifications & competence of the key personnel	Total marks	
	Maximum Marks →	40	20	40	100	
1	Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Association MAV Associates	40	19	Not evaluated as per clause 3.4(x)(e)		Non Responsive
2	L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	40	20	Not evaluated as per clause 3.4(x)(e)		Non Responsive
3	Shrikhande Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association Infra design Studio Pvt. Ltd.	40	15	36.94	91.94	Responsive
4	Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association OTP Consulting LLP	40	16	35.90	91.90	Responsive

6. In view of the above, TEC agreed and recommended that 2 (two) bidders qualify for the next stage of evaluation i.e. Evaluation of Financial Proposal:

Sr. No.	Name of Bidder	Eligible for Financial Opening	Nos. of on-going projects with NHIDCL	
1	Shrikhande Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association Infra design Studio Pvt. Ltd.	Eligible	Shrikhande	0
			Infra Design	0
2	Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association OTP Consulting LLP	Eligible	Sterling	2
			OTP Consulting	0

7. TEC, thus, recommended that:

- i) The scores of the firms in second stage evaluation as brought out in the para 5 above and the list of the technically qualified bidders may be uploaded online on CPP Portal and NHIDCL website, giving opportunity to the bidders to respond.
- ii) Financial Bids may be opened subsequently with the approval of the Competent Authority.

Meeting ended with vote of thanks to Chair.



Sh. Bhaskar Mallick  
Manager (Fin.)  
(Member)



Sh. B. Shivprasad  
GM (Tech.)  
(Member Secretary)



Sh. Pankaj Grover  
GM (Tech.)  
(Member)



Sh. K.P Singh  
Executive Director-III  
(Chairman)

# Annexure-I

S. No.	Details of documents to be submitted as per RFP 4.1(B)	1	2	3	4
		Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Association MAV Associates	L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	Shrikhande Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association Infra design Studio Pvt. Ltd.	Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association OTP Consulting LLP
1.	Power of Attorney for signing of Application	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
2.	If applicable, the Power of Attorney for Lead Member of JV.	NA	NA	NA	NA
3.	Copy of Memorandum of Understanding between JV partners, if applicable.	NA	NA	NA	NA
4.	Copy of Memorandum of Understanding with Associate, if applicable.	Yes	NA	Yes	Yes
5.	Firms credentials as per format prescribed in Section-3 of RFP.(The details are to be submitted through INFRACON only)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
6.	Technical proposal as per format prescribed in Section-4 of RFP. (The details are to be submitted through INFRACON only)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
7.	Online Payment Receipt towards cost of RFP of Rs. 5,900/- (Five Thousand and Nine Hundred only) in favour of NHIDCL.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
8.	Integrity Pact as per Cl. 4.1 (B) (IV) of Section-2 of RFP.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
9.	Appendix B-11 (Details of Ongoing and awarded work in NHIDCL) as per Cl. 1.7(e) of Section-2 of RFP.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Evaluation Criteria for Assessment of Experience of the Firm.							
S. No.	Description		Max Marks	Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd.in Association MAV Associates	L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	Shrikhande Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association Infra Design Studio Pvt. Ltd.	Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association OTP Consulting LLP
				Assessed Marks	Assessed Marks	Assessed Marks	Assessed Marks
1	Average Annual Turnover (last 3 years) from consultancy business		2	2	2	2	2
	<20.71 Cr – 0 marks						
	20.71 Cr – 1.5 marks						
	Add for additional turnover 0.25 (Zero point two five) marks for every Rs. 10.36 Cr above Rs. 10.36 Cr subject to maximum 0.5 marks						
2	Nos. of Highway Professionals with the firm *		10	10	10	10	10
2.1	<10	0					
2.2	>10 but <20	8					
2.3	>20 but ≤30	9					
2.4	>30	10					
*The professionals who possess degree in Civil Engineering/Transport Planning /Transport Economics/Traffic Management / Geology/ Environment Science or Engineering and 8 years experience in highway/bridge /tunnel with employment in the firm for more than one year. The current Employment Certificate shall be uploaded by Key Personnel on INFRACON.							
3	Experience as Independent Engineer/ Authority Engineer/ Construction Supervision in Number of Highway Projects of 2/4/6-laning** of length equal to [18.06] km or more in last 7 years.  1 project – 8 marks Add 1(one) mark extra for completed assignment of Authority Engineer/Independent Engineer and add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for completed assignment of supervision consultancy subject to maximum		10	10	10	10	10
4	Design Report preparation for Number of Highway Projects of 2/4/6-laning** of length (equal to [18.06] km or more in last 7 years. Experience in DPR/Feasibility Study cum Preliminary  1 project – 4 marks Add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1 mark.		5	5	5	5	5
5	In hand DPRs of Highway/Bridge/Tunnel Projects ( presently under progress)		10	10	10	10	10
5.1	<2	0					
5.2	2-5	5					
5.3	>5	10					
6	Experience in Construction Supervision/DPR/Design Review of Major structures having length of more than 500 meter in last 7 years.  1 project – 2.0 marks Add 0. 5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1.0 marks		3	3	3	3	3
Total			40	40	40	40	40

2	Evaluation Criteria for assessment of experience in use of technology for road inspection						
	Name of the bidder		Chaitanya Projects Consultanhcy Pvt. Ltd.in Association MAV	L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	Shrikhande Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association Infra Design Studio Pvt. Ltd.	Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association OTP Consulting	
S. No.	Description		Max Marks	Assessed Marks	Assessed Marks	Assessed Marks	
1	Experience in Network Survey Vehicle (NSV) or better technology for pavement inspection		7	7	7	6	
1.1	Equipment		4				
	(a) Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis Basic - 2 marks						
	(b) Own Equipment - 4 marks						
1.2	Experience		3				
(i)	1-2 projects	1					
(ii)	3-5 projects	2					
(iii)	> 5 projects	3					
2	Experience in Falling Weight Deflectometer (FWD) or better technology for pavement strength measurement		4	4	4	4	
2.1	Equipment		2				
	(a) Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis - 1 marks						
	(b) Own Equipment - 2 marks						
2.2	Experience		2				
(i)	1-3 Projects	1					
(ii)	>3 Projects	2					
3	Experience in Mobile Bridge Inspection Unit or better technology for bridge inspection		5	4	5	0	3
3.1	Equipment		2				
	(a) Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis- 1 mark						
	(b) Own Equipment - 2 mark						
3.2	Experience		3				
(i)	1-2 Projects	1					
(ii)	3-5 Projects	2					
(iii)	> 5 Projects	3					
4	Experience in Retro reflectometer technology		4	4	4	4	3
4.1	Equipment		2				
	(a) Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis- 1 mark						
	(b) Own Equipment- 2 marks						
4.2	Execution with owned / hired Equipment / through Associate		2				
(i)	1-3 Projects	1					
(ii)	>3 Projects	2					
Total			20	19	20	15	16

*Evaluation of Technical Proposal - Summary of Key Personnel*

S. No.	Position	Total marks	2	4
			Shrikhande Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association Infra Design Studio Pvt. Ltd.	Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association OTP Consulting LLP
			Marks	Marks
1	Team Leader cum Senior Bridge Engineer	12	10.92	10.68
2	Resident cum Highway Engineer	6	5.46	5.46
3	Bridge/Structural engineer	6	5.46	5.04
4	Senior Quality cum Material Expert	6	5.46	5.46
5	Senior Contract Specialist	6	6.00	5.46
6	Road Safety Expert	4	3.64	3.80
	Total	40	36.94	35.90

National Highways & Infrastructure Development Corporation Limited  
(Ministry of Road Transport & Highways, Government of India)

**2<sup>nd</sup> Minutes of Meeting of Technical Bid Evaluation Committee (TEC) to evaluate the Technical bids for CONSULTANCY SERVICES FOR AUTHORITY'S ENGINEER FOR SUPERVISION OF**

(I) Construction & Upgradation to 2 lane with paved shoulder from Design Km. 67.805 (at the end of Km 83rd tunnel near Dhrabshala) to Km 80.675 (Dulhasti) of 12.87 Km length on Khellani - Kishtwar -Chattroo section of NH-244 in the Union Territory of Jammu & Kashmir on EPC mode (Pkg -III). &

(II) Construction of Kishtwar bypass with 2 lane with paved shoulder from Design Km. 80.675 (Dulhasti) to Km 95.550 (bandarkoot ) of 14.88 Km length on Khellani - Kishtwar -Chattroo section and a link road to Kishtwar town of 1.871 km on NH-244 in the Union Territory of Jammu & Kashmir on EPC mode (Pkg -IV). &

(III) Construction /Up gradation 2 lane with paved shoulder from Design Km 95.55 (Bandarkoot ) to Km. 111.06 (Chattroo) of 15.52 Km length on Khellani - Kishtwar - Chattroo section on NH-244 in the Union Territory of Jammu & Kashmir on EPC mode (Pkg -V).

**Date:** 17.08.2021 (10:00 AM)

**Venue:** PTI Building, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, Conference Hall, NHIDCL HQ, New Delhi.

Following 04 (four) firms submitted their bids online on the CPP Portal and Infracon Portal for the subject project by due date and time.

- i. Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Association MAV Associates
- ii. L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.
- iii. Shrikhande Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association Infra design Studio Pvt. Ltd.
- iv. Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association OTP Consulting LLP

2. After Technical Evaluation of both the stages following firms have been qualified for the opening of financial bid :

- i. Shrikhande Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association Infra design Studio Pvt. Ltd.
- ii. Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association OTP Consulting LLP

3. Three bidders have submitted their representation in response to the final technical scores communicated vide Minutes of Meeting dated 11.08.2021. The submissions of the bidders have been examined by the committee and replies by the technical evaluation committee are as below:



Sr. No.	Name of the Bidder	TEC Remarks
1.	<b>Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd.</b>	
	Submitted the evaluation of Team Leader for consideration.	Bidder has submitted the evaluation of Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer instead of Team Leader cum Senior Bridge Engineer which is not in line with the RFP. Hence, the result remains unchanged.
2	<b>L. N. Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.</b>	
	Submitted the evaluation of Team Leader for consideration.	As per the details mentioned in data uploaded /provided on INFRACON Portal before Bid Due Date/move data, Team Leader cum Senior Bridge Engineer proposed by the bidder is not getting min. marks i.e. 75%. The INFRACON project claimed by the bidder does not have bridge details as required in RFP for evaluation, which is necessary to provide on INFRACON portal. In addition, the representation received from the bidder is without the details of essential information as per the RFP. Hence, the result remains unchanged.
3	<b>Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd.</b>	
	Experience in Retro Reflectometer Technology: Total marks 4 should be considered under this category instead of 3 as given in the technical evaluation.	As per MoRTH circular dated 06.01.2021, evaluation has been re-examined and final score against the experience in use of technology for road inspection is given in para 4 below.

4. The final technical scores of the firms w. r. t. technical evaluation are mentioned as under:

Summary of evaluation of Technical Proposals						Remarks
S. No.	Name of the Firm	Relevant experience for assignments	Experience in use of technology for road inspection	Qualifications & competence of the key personnel	Total marks	
	<b>Maximum Marks →</b>	<b>40</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>40</b>	<b>100</b>	
1	Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Association MAV Associates	40	19	Not evaluated as per clause 3.4(x)(e)		<b>Non Responsive</b>
2	L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	40	20	Not evaluated as per clause 3.4(x)(e)		<b>Non Responsive</b>
3	Shrikhande Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association Infra design Studio Pvt. Ltd.	40	20	36.94	<b>96.94</b>	<b>Responsive</b>
4	Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association OTP Consulting LLP	40	20	35.90	<b>95.90</b>	<b>Responsive</b>

5. In view of the above, TEC agreed and recommended that the following 02 (two) bidders qualify for the next stage of evaluation i.e. Stage-III: Evaluation of Financial Proposal:

- i. Shrikhande Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association Infra design Studio Pvt. Ltd.
- ii. Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association OTP Consulting LLP

6. After due deliberation, TEC observed that there is no change in technical evaluation result and hence, recommended to open the financial bids of all the qualified bidders as mentioned in Para 5 above.

Meeting ended with vote of thanks to the Chair.




Sh. Bhaskar Mallick  
Manager (Fin.)  
(Member)



Sh. Ashok Kumar Jha  
GM (Tech.)  
(Member)



Sh. B. Shivprasad  
GM (Tech.)  
(Member Secretary)



Sh. K. P. Singh  
Executive Director-III  
(Convener)

