

# राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग एवं अवसंरचना विकास निगम लिमिटेड

सड़क परिवहन और राजमार्ग मंत्रालय, भारत सरकार  
तीसरी मंजिल, पीटीआई बिल्डिंग, 4-संसद मार्ग, नई दिल्ली-110 001

National Highways & Infrastructure Development Corporation Limited

Ministry of Road Transport & Highways, Govt. of India

3rd Floor, PTI Building, 4-Parliament Street, New Delhi-110001, +91 11 2335 1282, www.nhidcl.com



CIN: U45400DL2014GOI269062

सार्वजनिक क्षेत्र का उपक्रम

No. NHIDCL/Ar.Pr./Roing-Hunli/AE/2017

A PUBLIC SECTOR UNDERTAKING

Date: 04/10/2017

To,

M/s Voyants Solutions Pvt Ltd	M/s L.N. Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	M/s Yongma Engineering Co. Ltd. in Association with M/s Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt Ltd.	M/s Highway Engineering Consultant in Association with Agnitio Infrastructure Project Pvt. Ltd & M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd.(JV)	M/s Feedback Infra Pvt Ltd. in Association with M/s A&A Consulting Engineers
-------------------------------	---	---	---	--

**Subject:** "Consultancy Services for Authority Engineer for Supervision of " Construction of 2 lane road with Paved Shoulders from Meka-Roing-Hunli from existing Km 16 of Roing Hunli section to Km 21.5 of Hunli-Anini Road (Greenfield alignment) (NH-313) (Total Length = 74.863 Km) in Arunachal Pradesh under Arunachal Pradesh package of SARDP-NE on Engineering Procurement and Construction (EPC) basis." -**Opening of Financial Bid regarding.**

Sir,

Please refer to your bid dated 23.03.2017 submitted towards subject cited project. The following is the list of technically responsive Bidders. The financial bids of technically responsive bidders shall be opened on 17<sup>th</sup> Oct, 2017 (11.00 hrs) in NHIDCL HQ, 3<sup>rd</sup> floor PTI Building, 4-Parliament Street, New Delhi-110001.

S. No.	Name of Bidder	Technical Score	Status
1	M/s Voyants Solutions Pvt Ltd	89.02	Eligible for opening of financial bid
2	M/s L.N. Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	81.06	Eligible for opening of financial bid
3	M/s Yongma Engineering Co. Ltd. in Association with M/s Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt Ltd.	89.71	Eligible for opening of financial bid
4	M/s Highway Engineering Consultant in Association with Agnitio Infrastructure Project Pvt. Ltd & M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd.(JV)	89.10	Eligible for opening of financial bid
5	M/s Feedback Infra Pvt Ltd. in Association with M/s A&A Consulting Engineers	83.77	Eligible for opening of financial bid Provisionally as per para 12 of attached Minutes of meeting (ETEC)

2. The copy of minutes of meeting of Empowered Technical Evaluation Committee (ETEC) dated 27.09.2017 is also enclosed.

3. In case of any representation, the bidders may represent by 11<sup>th</sup> October 2017 (1100 hrs).

4. All the Authorized Representatives are requested to attend the opening of Financial Bids at the Scheduled date and time.

Yours Faithfully

Y.C Srivastava  
General Manager (T)



**Subject: Minutes of Meeting of Empowered Technical Evaluation Committee (ETEC) for Technical Bids for Consultancy Services for Authority Engineer for Supervision of " Construction of 2 lane road with Paved Shoulders from Meka-Roing-Hunli from existing Km 16 of Roing Hunli section to Km 21.5 of Hunli-Anini Road (Greenfield alignment) (NH-313) (Total Length = 74.863 Km) in Arunachal Pradesh under Arunachal Pradesh package of SARDP-NE on Engineering Procurement and Construction (EPC) basis." held at NHIDCL, New Delhi on 27.09.2017 (2<sup>nd</sup> meeting).**

1. ETEC Committee in its meeting dated 17.04.2017 has recommended for opening of financial bids of technically responsive bidders. Consequent upon Approval of Competent Authority the technical score of the bidders along with minutes of meeting were uploaded on the website to submit the clarification/representation if any by the consultant on or before 17.05.2017(11:00 hrs). The uploaded scores of respective consultants are tabulated below.

Sr. No.	Name of Bidder	Technical Score	Status
1	M/s Voyants Solutions Pvt Ltd	87.18	Eligible
2	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd	-	Not-Eligible for opening of financial bid due to debarment from NHA for a period of 3 years from 28.03.2017.
3	M/s Yongma Engineering Co. Ltd. in Association with M/s Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt Ltd.	86.48	Eligible
4	M/s Highway Engineering Consultant in Association with Agnitio Infrastructure Project Pvt. Ltd & M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd.(JV)	93.53	Eligible
5	M/s Feedback Infra Pvt Ltd. in Association with M/s A&A Consulting Engineers	79.20	Eligible

2. In response Consultants have represented against the published scores. However Competent Authority decided that Technical Evaluation should also be done through INFRACON Portal. Hence, the technical score of Responsive bidders after representation was not uploaded on Website. Accordingly technical evaluation of bidders has been processed through INFRACON Portal.

3. It was brought to the notice of Committee that there are some discrepancies observed in Evaluation through INFRACON Portal i.e. Project Start & Completion date, Major Activities, Nature of Assignment, No. of Bridges, No. of Bridges with Pile/Well Foundation, rehabilitation and Repair, modern Technology, 2,4,6 lane for Highway Projects & Arbitration Cases handled in CVs of Key Personnel uploaded on INFRACON Portal for subject Project, hence it was decided to validate the INFRACON Portal of AE with manual evaluation by sorting out each and every issue regarding incomplete information submitted by Key Personnel and the Consultant. Frequent reminders were given to the Consultants telephonically for updating the CVs and the data on INFRACON moved multiple times for identification of the issues and same was sorted out accordingly. Now the INFRACON Portal of AE is updated and the evaluation through INFRACON Portal has been validated.

4. It was also brought to the notice of ETEC Committee that at present INFRACON Portal has evaluation mechanism for 6 Key Personnel which are given in model document of the ministry. Ministry vide letter No RW-NH-34048/7/2013-S&R (B) dated 01.01.2016 directed to include two Key Personnel i.e. Bridge Design Specialist and Highway Design Specialist for the Authority Engineer projects. It is also informed to Committee by member secretary that online evaluation of Bridge Design Specialist can be done on the line of Bridge/Structural Engineer. However online of Highway Design Specialist is not available on the INFRACON. Therefore the CV of Highway Design Specialist is evaluated manually. Secondly online evaluation for Material Engineer is

*Amha* *B. J.* *S.* *Amha* *Amha*



designed for 95 marks and remaining 5 marks to be evaluated manually. Therefore marking for 5marks has been carried out manually.

5. Further, it is observed that Mr. Rajib Sarkar, Bridge Design Specialist having intermittent input of M/s Highway Engineering Consultant in association with M/s Agnitio Infrastructure Projects Ltd & M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt Ltd (JV) has already engaged/ part of H1 bidder in 3 projects hence his CV is not considered for this instant project and given zero marks in accordance with Appendix-B-5 of RFP i.e. CVs of key personnel having intermittent inputs will be considered only if the assignments on hand as on 7 days before due date of proposal including those for which LOA has been received from the Client or for which Consultant has been declared as H1 do not exceed 3(three).

6. The Final Technical score obtained after reevaluation through INFRACON Portal as well as manual evaluation of Highway Design Specialist are as under (Complete Evaluation Sheet is at Annexure-I) .

Company Name	Firm's Relevant Experience for the assignment (Max. points 25)	Qualifications and Competence of the Key Staff for the assignment (Max. points 75)	Total (Max. points 100)
Unique Team ID: 2017-36-83_5566 Voyants Solutions Private Limited	25.00	64.02	89.02
Unique Team ID: 2017-36-16497_7343 L N MALVIYA INFRA PROJECTS PVT. LTD.	24.50	56.56	81.06
Unique Team ID: 2017-36-564_4038 YONGMA ENGINEERING CO LTD STERLING INDO TECH CONSULTANTS P LTD	23.75	65.96	89.71
Unique Team ID: 2017-36-2538_3530 HIGHWAY ENGINEERING CONSULTANT Agnitio Infrastructure Projects Pvt. Ltd. Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd.	24.50	64.60	89.10
Unique Team ID: 2017-36-484_2486 Feedback Infra Private Limited A & A CONSULTING ENGINEER	25.00	58.77	83.77

7. The reasons for variation in the uploaded marks and now evaluated through INFRACON Portal is tabulated below.

Sr. No.	Name of Bidder	Technical Score (Manual Evaluation)	Final Technical Score (Through INFRACON)	Remarks for Variation
1	M/s Voyants Solutions Pvt Ltd	87.18	89.02	CVs are formatted as per INFRACON requirement and evaluated thereafter.
2	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd	-	81.06	CVs are now evaluated and Mr. Kareti Sree Ramakanth CV was blocked on INFRACON Portal due to multiple IDs.
3	M/s Yongma Engineering Co. Ltd. in Association with M/s Sterling Indo Tech Consultants	86.48	89.71	CVs are formatted as per INFRACON requirement and evaluated thereafter

*[Handwritten signatures and initials]*



	Pvt Ltd.			
4	M/s Highway Engineering Consultant in Association with Agnitio Infrastructure Project Pvt. Ltd & M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd.(JV)	93.53	89.10	Reason as mentioned in Para 5 above. Regarding MoM of Akajan-Likabali (Annexure-II) shall also be considered in conjunction with this MoM.
5	M/s Feedback Infra Pvt Ltd. in Association with M/s A&A Consulting Engineers	79.20	83.77	(i) In manual evaluation Mr. Resident Engineer cum Pavement specialist and road safety expert has not shown his educational details therefore zero marks given which is updated on submission of proof on INFRACON Portal. (ii) Mr. Bimal Chandra Chanda as Senior Quantity Surveyor in their team. M/s Yongma Engineering Co. Ltd. in Association with M/s Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt Ltd & M/s Feedback Infra Pvt Ltd. in Association with M/s A&A Consulting Engineers both have proposed. Mr. Bimal Chandra Chanda has given undertaking that he gave consent to M/s Yongma Engineering Co. Ltd. in Association with M/s Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt Ltd only. Therefore marks for Senior Quantity Surveyor for M/s Feedback Infra Pvt Ltd. in Association with M/s A&A Consulting Engineers considered zero.

8. Following key personnel less than 75 marks requiring replacement as per RFP if stands H1 bidder.

Sr. No.	Consultant	Key Personnel	Marks	Remarks
1	M/s Voyants Solutions Pvt Ltd	Bridge Design Specialist (Mr. Sathani Hanumanthu)	37	-
2	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd	Resident Engineer cum Pavement specialist and road safety expert (Mr. Kareti Sree Ramakanth)	0	His CV was blocked on INFRACON Portal.
3	M/s Highway Engineering Consultant in Association with Agnitio Infrastructure Project Pvt. Ltd & M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd.(JV)	Bride Design Specialist (Mr. Rajib Sarkar)	0	He is already engaged/part of H1 bidder in 3 projects
4	M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited	Senior Quantity Surveyor (Mr. Bimal Chandra Chanda)	0	He has given undertaking that he gave consent to M/s Yongma Engineering Co. Ltd. in Association with M/s Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt Ltd only

9. M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd vide letter dated 20.04.2017 has submitted that the debarment order issued by NHAI has been stayed by Hon'ble High Court of Delhi and submitted copy of stay Order dated 20.04.2017 of Hon'ble High Court of Delhi.

10. M/s Highway Engineering Consultant vide letter dated 05.09.2017 has Submitted that the debarment order issued by Government of Telangana State National Highways Roads and Building Department has been suspended by Hon'ble High Court of Hyderabad till 31.07.2017 and the

matter is still pending in High Court and as per the latest update available on website of Hyderabad High Court, the next date of hearing is 03.10.2017.

11. It is observed that M/s Feedback Infra Projects Pvt Ltd was debarred by World Bank on 15.05.2017. Hence explanation was sought from the Consultant. The reply of the Consultant was deliberated in 38<sup>th</sup> meeting of Executive Committee wherein it was decided that M/s Feedback Infra Projects Pvt Ltd is to be provisionally qualified and clarification on debarment may be sought from the Ministry/Law Ministry.

12. Committee deliberated on this issue and opined that in case the provisionally eligible firm becomes H1 then the award shall be subjected to outcome of the decision in the referred matter. Further, in case firm becomes H2 or else the committee will proceed for finalization of financial evaluation and action thereon.

13. Bid validity has been extended by respective bidders as tabulated below.

Sr. No.	Name of Bidder	Extended upto
1	M/s Voyants Solutions Pvt Ltd	30.11.2017
2	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd	19.12.2017
3	M/s Yongma Engineering Co. Ltd. in Association with M/s Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt Ltd	21.11.2017
4	M/s Highway Engineering Consultant in Association with Agnitio Infrastructure Project Pvt. Ltd & M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd.(JV)	21.11.2017
5	M/s Feedback Infra Pvt Ltd. in Association with M/s A&A Consulting Engineers	21.11.2017

14. In view of the above, committee recommends that Financial bids of the following firms with respective Technical scores to be opened with the approval of Competent Authority.

Sr. No.	Name of Bidder	Final Technical Score
1	M/s Voyants Solutions Pvt Ltd	89.02
2	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt Ltd	81.06
3	M/s Yongma Engineering Co. Ltd. in Association with M/s Sterling Indo Tech Consultants Pvt Ltd.	89.71
4	M/s Highway Engineering Consultant in Association with Agnitio Infrastructure Project Pvt. Ltd & M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd.(JV)	89.10
5	M/s Feedback Infra Pvt Ltd. in Association with M/s A&A Consulting Engineers	83.77

Meeting ended with vote of thanks to chair.

 (V.K. Rajawat) (ED-I) Convener	 (Y.C. Srivastava) (GM-Tech) Member Secretary	 Sandeep Gupta (GM-Tech) Member	 A.K. Jha DGM (Tech) Presenting Officer	 Uttam Chatterjee (DGM-Fin.) Member
---	---	---	--	---